Evaluation Strategy Report

For Training Program
“Enhance the Appearance of Training Materials”

Prepared by: Julia Li
Process Design Consultants Inc.

Table of Contents

Executive Summary 1

Statement of Purpose.....2

Background Information 3

Description of the Evaluation Strategy.....4

Level 1: Learners Reaction.....4

Level 2: Learning.....9

Level 3: Behaviour.....17

Level 4: Results.....21

Conclusions and Recommendations 23

Executive Summary

According to the needs assessment conducted in our training and development company, a internal training program, “Enhance the Appearance of training materials” has been designed, developed and delivered to the company consultants with the intent to increase productivity, to improve project quality and promote innovational learning. This is a new training program, and there is no similar training has been conducted in the past. It is worthwhile to invest time and effort to do a detailed evaluation.

The purpose of this evaluation report is to find out how helpful the workshop is , what the consultants have learned , how the learner’s behavior change after the training, and finally , how the results will impact the business bottom line. In this report, the goal is not to measure return on investment.

The strategy of this evaluation report is based on Donald Kirkpatrick’s Four-level model on evaluating training program. They are:

Level 1 - Reaction:	This is a measure of how participants feel about the training program. It is a measure of customer satisfaction. (Reaction sheet)
Level 2 - Learning:	Measure of the knowledge acquired, skills improved, or attitude changes due to training. (Pre-Post test, Pre-then-Post)
Level 3 - Behaviour:	This is a measure of the extent to which participants change their on-the-job behaviour, because of training. It is commonly referred to as transfer of training. (Observation checklist, follow-up calls, records of company)
Level 4 - Results:	This is a measure of final results occur due to training. It referred to business results, the bottom line impact. (Alternative approach rather than return on investment)

Using the Four-level model as a guideline, the following conclusions have been drawn and recommendations have been made.

- Overall the training is very successful. The objectives have been met, the knowledge and skills of participant has increased, transfer of training has occurred, direct linkage of impact on the business bottom line has been witnessed.
- The training is necessary for all consultants within the organization.
- It is work-related and will increase effectiveness, efficiency, quality, and productivity.
- The training has direct link to company’s vision and mission
- The consultants who attended training find themselves equipped with better document design knowledge and skills, more confident and competent in creating and managing larger document files, and able to respond with greater speed to business opportunities
- Company’s standards on training document formatting has been clarified and emphasized.
- The training is a good investment for our company.
- Establishing internal training as a business routine

Statement of Purpose

The purpose of this evaluation report is to find out how helpful the workshop is, what consultants have learned, how the behavior changed after the training, and finally, how the results will impact the business bottom line.

There are more than 20 consultants who work for the company. They have completed this training in three separate training sessions. The company has invested time and money and effort on determining the gap, identifying the needs, designing, developing and delivering this program. It is the time to conduct a thorough evaluation on the training program, “Enhance the Appearance of Training Materials”.

The evaluation has taken place before the training, during the training and after the training. The evaluation process is fully supported and sponsored by the senior executives in the company.

The workshop instructor is responsible for generating the evaluation report. She has been working very closely with the program designer, office support staff, project manager, and consultants to ensure that findings are accurate and objective.

The results will be submitted to senior executives in the company in written format. The findings will be presented at a company managers’ meeting.

Background Information

Our company is a training and consulting company. Training programs are marketed as a very important part of products. Many consultants work for our company on a project basis.

Although they can use word-processing software, the document layouts of their projects (training materials) do not meet company standards. On many occasions, reformatting has been to done before the project results reach the customer. It is time consuming and causes difficulty in meeting project deadlines.

The need for consultants to acquire knowledge of design concepts and the ability to use company templates have been identified in a needs assessment. To close the gap, a training program is needed. As a consequence, the internal training program, “Enhance the Appearance of Training Materials” has been designed, developed and delivered to the consultants.

The learning objective for training program, “Enhance the Appearance of Training Materials”, has identified as the following:

- Using the handouts and templates provided, the learner will be able to enhance the appearance of training materials by combining four document design concepts and company’s templates on computer as evaluated by the instructor.

The preferred size of the workshop will be 4 - 8 people.

This 4-hour session focuses on increasing consultants’ knowledge of document design concepts and their ability to applying existing document templates to projects.

The workshop consists of lecture, demonstration, group exercise, mini presentation, two written tests and individual exercises on computer.

Please refer attached documentation at the back of this report for more detailed information on this program.

Description of the Evaluation Strategy

The evaluation strategy adopted in this report is based on Donald Kirkparick's classic four-level model for evaluating training program. The simplicity and practical characteristics of this model provide general guidelines for the evaluation of this training program.

The core concepts of four level models are:

- Level 1: Learners Reaction
- Level 2: Learning
- Level 3: Behaviour
- Level 4: Results

This study will discuss evaluation strategy in detail. It includes data collection methods, instrument designed, results on each level, and discussion/analysis of the results.

Level 1: Measuring Learner Reaction

This is a measure of how participants feel about the training program. It is a measure of customer (client) satisfaction. The valuable feedback from the participant will help improve design, delivery and future training, although it is not necessary an in-depth, objective measurement at this stage. It has been widely used in various training programs.

Data Collection Method

A Level 1 Reaction Sheet has been designed to measure learners' reaction after they completed the training "Enhance the Appearance of Training Materials" before leaving. The purpose of this reaction sheet is to give the learner the opportunity to bring out important issues, concerns, and recommendations to this training program.

Each participant was asked to complete the "Workshop Evaluation – Participant Feedback" before leaving the workshop. Workshop instructor will collect the reaction sheets.

Expected Results

The expected results of this measure are that learners would feel the training is valuable and work-related.

Focus areas of reaction sheet

Four areas have been addressed in this reaction sheet:

1. Instructor's knowledge and delivery
   - guidance for learning
   - directly contribute to achieve workshop objectives
2. Workshop materials:
   - test the clarity of instruction
   - usefulness of exercise/cases/examples
   - if they are work-related
3. Learning environment:
   - the physical comfort level while they are in this training
4. Overall:
   - how valuable they feel about this training
   - opportunity to make comments and suggestions

See next page for Level 1 reaction sheet: Workshop Evaluation – Participant Feedback.

Workshop Evaluation

Participant Feedback

Course Name: **Enhancing the Appearance of Training Materials** **Date: _____**

Please answer these questions about workshop "Enhancing the Appearance of Training Materials". Your comments will be greatly appreciated and will be used in improving the workshop to suit participants' needs in the future.(Please circle one answer that you feel is most appropriate to you.)

Instructor

1. What is the instructor 's knowledge level o about the workshop content?

   Excellent Very Good Average Fair Poor

2. Did the instructor conduct the workshop in a pace that suits your learning needs?

   Yes No

Workshop Materials

1. How would you describe the pre-workshop assignment in terms of preparing you for the course?

   Very helpful helpful not helpful

2. Are the instructions of the exercises clearly written?

   Yes No

3. Do you feel that the examples and cases used in the workshop are work-related?

   Yes No

Learning Environment

1. Did you feel comfortable with the room setting, lighting etc. during the workshop? (Suggestions if you have any?)

   Yes No

Overall

1. Have the learning objectives of the workshop been met?

   Yes No

2. What was the most helpful or valuable to you about this workshop?

3. Do you think what you learned in the workshop will be helpful to your future project?

   Yes No

4. Would you recommend this workshop to other people within the organization?

   Yes No

5. Other comments and suggestions:

Thank you for your assistance.

Level 1 Evaluation Results

The results were based on 20 reaction sheets collected from 3 workshops. The results and comments for each area are summarized below.

Instructor

1. What is the instructor's knowledge level about the workshop content?

	Excellent	Very Good	Average	Fair	Poor
No. responded	2	15	2	1	

2. Did the instructor conduct the workshop in a pace that suits your learning needs?

	Yes	No
No. responded	19	1

- I wish to have more time to practise, because I am new to the company.

Workshop Materials

1. How would you describe the pre-workshop assignment in terms of preparing you for the course?

	Very helpful	Helpful	Not helpful
No. responded	12	8	2

- The pre-workshop materials helped me to think about what a well-formatted training materials can do in the learning environment
- It made me think about what I did well in the past in formatting, what could be improved, and what was not well done.
- Words on flipchart could be bigger, so I can see them better.

2. Are the instructions of the exercises clearly written?

	Yes	No
No. responded	20	

3. Do you feel that the examples and cases used in the workshop are work-related?

	Yes	No
No. responded	20	

- I feel I can apply them right away in my project.
- All the document templates introduced are work-related.

Learning Environment

1. Did you feel comfortable with the room setting, lighting etc. during the workshop? (Suggestions if you have any?)

	Yes	No
No. responded	19	1

- Thicker blinds in the conference room will help reduce reflection while working on computer.
- The refreshment is definitely a boost to our energy level, thanks.

Overall

1. Have the learning objectives of the workshop been met?

	Yes	No
No. responded	20	

2. What was the most helpful or valuable to you about this workshop?
   - The document design concepts is very useful in preparing document, especially to training materials
   - Opportunity of work with others
   - Design concepts are new to me, but I feel I can use them in my project.
   - Using the design concepts as a guideline, I feel can make improvement on formatting.
   - It is good to know the existing document templates, it is also handy to use.
   - Practical examples and cases changing the way I do things

3. Do you think what you learned in the workshop will be helpful to your future project?

	Yes	No
No. responded	20	

4. Would you recommend this workshop to other people within the organization?

	Yes	No
No. responded	20	

5. Other comments and suggestions:
   - Everyone new to the company should have attended the session.
   - The company and each individual will benefit from it.
   - The use of document templates will increase effectiveness and productivity.
   - I feel I have a guideline to follow when I am formatting training materials.
   - Give me more creative ideas for the future projects.
   - I wished I knew this earlier.
   - Trigged more curiosity on document design.
   - The session will help me to express ideas in an enhanced format.
   - By using templates I can handle larger files without panic
   - More time to practise

Discussion and Analysis of Level 1 Results

The reactions for the workshop at this level are very positive and encouraging. The workshop achieved expected results: it is work-related and participants find it useful and feel confident that they can apply it to ongoing and future projects.

In general, all participants felt the learning objectives have been met. The instructor was well received by participants in 3 separate sessions. Most of them agreed that pre-workshop material were helpful. The course materials are clearly written and instructions are easy to follow. They all choose to recommend this workshop to someone within the organization. The document design concepts and company templates will assist them in terms of improving effectiveness and productivity in current and future projects.

The comments and suggestions from the participants confirmed the value of this workshop. They will be used in program modification in the future program.

Level 2: Learning

This is a measure of the knowledge acquired, skills improved, or attitude changes due to training.

At this level we need to confirm whether the learning objectives have been met, if the actual learning has taken place at an individual level, how effective the training is, and how to improve the learning. To achieve accurate evaluating results and validate learning, proper methods have to be carefully chosen and a direct link between evaluation questions and learning objectives must exist.

Data Collection Methods

1. Pre-Post Test

After considering a variety of test methods available, a pre-post test is constructed to determine the knowledge and skill level of participants. This pre-post test is conducted before the course starts. Instructor will collect it after each participant has completed it.

The purpose of pre-post test is to help the instructor detect learners' knowledge and skill level before the training, to enforce learning during the training, to alert the learner what they may not know. It is also a very important benchmark for deciding the changes due to the training. It focuses on two areas: knowledge of document design concepts and company's document templates. (See next page for actual pre-post test used)

2. Pre-Then-Post Test

This test is constructed to measure the effectiveness of training. It takes place after the whole training has been concluded. Aiming at obtaining accurate comparisons, the learners use the same frame of reference to rate themselves. A number of questions have been built into the first part of the test. By answering these questions learners have the opportunity to rate themselves on likert-type scales. They will rate their knowledge, skill or ability prior they feel they had prior to training and what they feel like know now (after the training).

The advantages of this instrument presented here enables learners (also instructor/ evaluator) obtain the changes at a glance. (See Section I in Pre-Then-Post test for reference)

In section II, test questions as same as the questions in Pre-Post Test. The instructor is looking for if learning objectives have been met and how learning has taken place at individual level.

Expected Results

Participants will be able to describe four basic document design concepts in detail and are aware of company document templates and know how to apply them.

Pre-Post Test

What do you know about

Enhance the Appearance of Training Materials

Please answer the following questions before attending the workshop "Enhancing the Appearance of Training Materials". Your responses will help us to reinforce your learning during the course and to improve the course design and delivery.

1 What advantages may a well-formatted training document have in the learning environment?

2 Please list below the document design concepts that you know or have heard of:

3 "Direction, contrast, consistence and relevance" are being considered when designing document layout. Please describe your understanding about them below.

- Direction
- Contrast
- Consistence
- Relevance

4 What are the current document templates in the company that you can use for training materials? (Please put ✓ beside the items you are aware of):

- ❑ Participant Materials
- ❑ Handouts
- ❑ Overheads
- ❑ Evaluation Form
- ❑ Instructor Guide
- ❑ Case Studies

5 If a template is provided to you, are you able to apply it to a document, for example, to a participant manual? (Please circle one answer)

Yes No

6 Can you create a new template for your project based on an existing document template? (Please circle one answer)

Yes No

Name: _____ Date: _____

Thank you for completing the quiz.

Pre-Then-Post Test

What do you know about

Enhance the Appearance of Training Materials

Please answer these questions about workshop “Enhancing the Appearance of Training Materials”. Your responses will help yourself to determine the learning effect on the individual level and they will also help us to improve course design and delivery.

Section I

Instruction: Using the following scales, rate yourself on the items listed below. Put an **X** to rate your knowledge, skill or ability you feel you had prior to this training. Put a ● (dot) on the same scale to rate your knowledge, skill or ability you feel you have now after the training.

1 Your knowledge of document design concepts

Low — Average — High

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9

2 Your awareness level of using design concepts when creating training material

Low — Average — High

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9

3 Your knowledge of company’s existing document templates of training materials

Low — Average — High

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9

4 Your ability to apply company’s templates to training materials, such as participant manual, etc.

Low — Average — High

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9

5 Your ability to create a new template for your project based on an existing document template

Low — Average — High

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9

6 Your confidence to create a document layout that will satisfy yourself

Low — Average — High

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9

7 Your confidence to create a document layout that will increase customer satisfaction

Low — Average — High

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9

Pre-Then-Post Test

What do you know about

Enhance the Appearance of Training Materials

Section II

1 What advantages may a well-formatted training document have in the learning environment?

2 Please list below the document design concepts that you know or have heard of:

3 "Direction, contrast, consistence and relevance" are being considered when designing document layout. Please describe your understanding about them below.

- Direction
- Contrast
- Consistence
- Relevance

4 What are the current document templates in the company that you can use for training materials? (Please put ✓ beside the items you are aware of):

- ❑ Participant Materials
- ❑ Handouts
- ❑ Overheads
- ❑ Evaluation Form
- ❑ Instructor Guide
- ❑ Case Studies

5 If a template is provided to you, are you able to apply it to a document, for example, to a participant manual? (Please circle one answer)

Yes No

6 Can you create a new template for your project based on an existing document template? (Please circle one answer)

Yes No

Name: _____ Date: _____

Thank you for completing the quiz.

Level 2 Evaluation Results

The results were based on 20 reaction sheets collected from 3 workshops. The results and comments for each area are summarized below.

1. Pre-Post Test Results

1 What advantages may a well-formatted training document have in the learning environment?

- Easy to read
- Promote company's images
- Participants will feel that we did invested on the course materials, they will feel they were treated special
- Increase overall quality of workshop

2 Please list below the document design concepts that you know or have heard of:

- Choose different font size to emphasize the contents
- Spacing
- Proportion
- Orientation
- Alignment of the objects
- Use clipart, underline, bold, or color to attract reader's attention

3 "Direction, contrast, consistence and relevance" are being considered when designing document layout. Please describe your understanding about them below.

- Direction
  - Choose the orientation of the page
  - Easy to follow
  - Orientation
- Contrast
  - Create different effect on different parts of the document
  - Create focus point
  - Emphasizing
- Consistence
  - Same header footer
  - Same level of heading should use same fonts
  - Consistent image of company
- Relevance
  - Do not overdo with different fonts that may cause confusion and distraction
  - Keep the document layout simple and to the point

4 What are the current document templates in the company that you can use for training materials? (Please put ✓ beside the items you are aware of):

	No. responded		No. responded
Participant Materials	3	Evaluation Form	8
Handouts	2	Instructor Guide	8
Overheads	2	Case Studies	3

5 If a template is provided to you, are you able to apply it to a document, for example, to a participant manual?

	Yes	No
No. responded	12	8

6 Can you create a new template for your project based on an existing document template?

	Yes	No
No. responded	6	14

2. Pre-Then-Post Test Results

Section I

Using the Likert-type scales, participants rate their knowledge, skill or ability they felt they had prior to this training and rate on the same scales that knowledge, skill or ability they feel they have now after the training. Here is the summary of the comparison.

Questions	Changes Occurred (No. of People Responded)			
	From Low to Average	From Low to High	From Average to High	No Changes
1. Your knowledge of document design concepts	6	10	4	0
2. Your awareness level of using design concepts when creating training material	6	9	5	0
3. Your knowledge of company's existing document templates of training materials	2	14	4	0
4. Your ability to apply company's templates to training materials, such as participant manual, etc.	4	10	6	0
5. Your ability to create a new template for your project based on an existing document template	2	12	6	0
6. Your ability to create a new template for your project based on an existing document template	4	8	8	0
7. Your confidence to create a document layout that will increase customer satisfaction	1	8	11	0

2. Pre-Then-Post Test Results

Section II

1 What advantages may a well-formatted training document have in the learning environment?

- Creates an inviting learning environment to learners
- Presents professional image for the company
- Helps learner to learn and instructor to teach
- Enhances the learning results
- Reinforces learning
- Creates a user-friendly and stimulating learning environment
- Makes projects more attractive and marketable.
- Customers and clients will be much happier – hit business bottom line.
- Increases the effectiveness of learning
- Contributes to achieve learning objectives

2 Please list below the document design concepts that you know or have heard of:

- Direction
- Contrast
- Consistence
- Relevance

3 "Direction, contrast, consistence and relevance" are being considered when designing document layout. Please describe your understanding about them below.

- Direction
  - Concerning natural reading flow of the languages used in the materials
  - Define clear starting point and end point
  - Retain reader's attention from start to end
  - Direction of information flow
  - Orientation of the actual layout (portrait, landscape)
  - Alignment of content elements
- Contrast
  - Create the effects to retain reader's attention and interests
  - Emphasis on contents
  - Methods (line/boxes, font size, bold, tables, graphics shading and orientation)
- Consistence
  - Create integrity/unity of document/or a course in a series
  - Detail part of document
  - Fonts, size, spacing, margin, header/footer etc.
  - Same header footer
  - Same level of heading should use same fonts
- Relevance
  - Everything must focus on the learning objectives and be relevant to the contents
  - Reduce distraction by removing unrelated cliparts or pictures, logos etc.
  - Carefully use colour pages in training materials, too many colours cause distractions. Keep the document layout simple and to the point
  - Focus on learning objectives

4 What are the current document templates in the company that you can use for training materials?

	No. responded		No. responded
Participant Materials	20	Evaluation Form	20
Handouts	20	Instructor Guide	20
Overheads	20	Case Studies	20

5 If a template is provided to you, are you able to apply it to a document, for example, to a participant manual?

	Yes	No
No. responded	20	0

6 Can you create a new template for your project based on an existing document template?

	Yes	No
No. responded	20	0

Discussion and Analysis of Level 2 Results

The results of level 2 evaluation for the workshop ”Enhance the Appearance of Training Materials” confirmed that learning has taken place at individual level. The comparison of the results between post test and pre-then-post test indicated the effectiveness of training. The overall results at this are positive.

All participants indicated that their knowledge about the document design and company’s templates have been increased. More than 80% of the participants achieved dramatic increase from low/average level to high level at each category. After training they all feel confident after training that they will increase customer satisfaction by enhancing the appearance of training materials. They understand that enhanced document layout can play a significant role in learning.

In section II of pre-then-post test, most of them can describe four design concepts and their details. They all aware of the document templates available and are capable to apply them when needed. They also acquired new skills on modifying document templates that enables them put their own creativity into practice.

If they didn’t attend this training, the leap of their knowledge and skills would not be expected to occur.

Level 3: Behaviour

According to Donald Kirkpatrick, “This is a measure of the extent to which participants change their on-the-job behaviour, because of training. It’s commonly referred to as transfer of training”

To detect and measure the transfer of training, some key questions have to be taken into consideration. :

- What happens when trainee returns to the job.
- What job behaviour changes occurred is due to this particular training?
- What is the best possible time to conduct level 3 evaluation?
- What is the best method to collect data and from whom?
- If the behaviour changes have been occurred due to the training, is that a positive impact on performance or negative?
- To what degree that the transfer has been made, and for how long
- How to sustain the positive impact on performance on the job.
- How to consolidate the transfer of training and build them in to business routine?

Data Collect Method

To answer these questions, an observation checklist has been designed. All the training materials which are designed or developed by the consultants will be submitted to an administrative assistant in the company for reproduction purpose. By examining those documents, the instructor conducts this level 3 evaluation.

The level 3 evaluation will taken place about one month after the consultants had attended this training. A comparison will be made between documents they constructed before the training and documents that they constructed after training.

In addition, the instructor will also make a follow-up call around this time, asking each participant if they are using the design concepts and documents templates on the job.

Expected Results:

- Evidence of deliberate use of document design concepts on the job
- Company’s document templates are used for training materials.
- Improved on-the-job performance

Observation Checklist

Course Name: **Enhancing the Appearance of Training Materials**
Name: _____ Date: _____

The following checklist is used to measure the behavioural changes that participants may demonstrate after they had attended the workshop "Enhancing the Appearance of Training Materials". By observing the documents they submitted to printing reproduction, the checklist should be conducted by the workshop instructor.

Design Concepts (check the boxes below that apply)

1. Direction
   - ❑ Clear starting point
   - ❑ Natural reading flow
   - ❑ Aligned content elements
   - ❑ Orientation of the actual layout
2. Consistence
   - ❑ Consistent page margins for each section
   - ❑ Consistent format of headers
   - ❑ Consistent format of footers
   - ❑ Same line spacing for paragraphs
   - ❑ Same fonts for same level of headings
3. Contrast
   - ❑ Different font sized used
   - ❑ Graphics used
   - ❑ Tables used
   - ❑ Cliparts used
4. Relevance
   - ❑ Cliparts relate to content

Templates

1. Does company have templates for this type of training material?
   - ❑ Yes (go to next question)
   - ❑ No (Additional comments part)
2. Was a company template applied to the document?
   - ❑ Yes (go to next question)
   - ❑ No (Additional comments part)
3. Which template was applied to the document?
   - ❑ Instructor Guide
   - ❑ Participant Manual
   - ❑ Prework
   - ❑ Overhead
   - ❑ Handouts
   - ❑ Case Study
4. Did the participant modify the document template?
   - ❑ Yes (specify what _____)
   - ❑ No

Additional Comments

1. What did the participant do extremely well in his/her document layout? Any examples?

2. What recommendations do you have?

Level 3 Evaluation Results

The instructor was able to obtain 20 observation checklists on training materials from consultants who had attended this training about three month ago.

Design Concepts

1. Direction

	No of document s demonstrated		No of document s demonstrated
Clear starting point	20	Natural reading flow	20
Aligned content elements	17	Orientation of the actual layout	17

2. Consistence

	No of documents demonstrated		No of documents demonstrated
Consistent page margins for each section	18	Consistent format of headers	17
Consistent format of footers	17	Same line spacing for paragraphs	19
Same fonts for same level of headings	20		

3. Contrast

	No of documents demonstrated		No of documents demonstrated
Different font sized used	20	Graphics used	14
Tables used	18	Cliparts used	17

4. Relevance

	No of document demonstrated (from 10 have cliparts)
Cliparts relate to content	8

Templates

- If Company has templates for this type of training material, 12 of 14 consultants have applied them to the document, two did not.
- Four people created their own document templates, which demonstrated the application of basic design concepts.
- Six people modified the company's templates to suit specific needs for clients

Discussion and Analysis of Level 3 Evaluation Results

The results of level 3 evaluation demonstrated a strong transfer of training to on-the-job projects. The results are positive. The training is effective.

By comparing the documents they had constructed before and after training, the results shows the 90% of them were able to apply the learning into practice. The evaluation confirmed achievement of expected results. From observation checklist and follow-up calls, there is a clear evidence of deliberate use of document design concepts and company document templates.

If they did not attend this training, ”Enhance the Appearance of Training Materials”, the improvement of their ability of applying document templates would not be obvious.

In addition, this training also boosted consultants’ confidence in handling large documents, in creating new document format and in improving their on-the-job performance.

Level 4: Results

This is a measure of the final results - business results – that occur due to training. They may include improved marked position of the company, increased sales, higher productivity, reduced cost, lower employee turnover higher quality of services and customer satisfaction.

Because there are many variables that have direct or indirect impact on business bottom line, seeking the sole training impact on business results would be challenging, but in many cases it is feasible.

For the training program, "Enhance the Appearance of Training Materials", there is a clear business outcomes from training. Specifying business measures made the evaluation at this level possible.

Due to the complexity of locating the resources (for example: time spent on actual project vs. proposal time, different billing rates of each consultants, the profit margin of the company, the confidentiality of salary system, etc.), this evaluation takes an alternative approach. It would not focus on dollar value of this program.

Data collection methods, business measures specified, resources of the data, and business impact are summarized in the following table.

Measures	How collect data	Collect from	Bottom-Line Impact
• Person reworked • # of typos • Comments by participants • Rating of training materials by participants	Check list (log) Log sheet Training program Reaction sheets	Support Staff Support Staff Instructor of training program	**Customer perception of value** **Higher Degree of customer satisfaction**
• Speed of making revision to materials	Number of days takes	Support Staff (Admin. Assistant) Developer/designer	**Reduced cost** **Meet deadlines** **Increase productivity**
• Speed of new product development	Actual days vs. project plan	Project manager, program developer/designer	**Reduced cost** **Catch market opportunity**
• Speed of customization of products	Program changes Past vs current (# of days)	Senior management Project manager, program developer and designer	**Strategic Advantage (company's mission)**

Level 4 Evaluation Results

By checking the records of project log in the company, the number of days that support staff spending on reformatting document has been reduced at least 50%, comparing to the similar project in the past. This is mainly due to consultants' increased ability of applying company templates. The workload of administrative assistant time spent on formatting or reformatting materials has been significantly reduced. There are less overtime spending on documents formatting in order to meet project deadline.

At same time, the results of the reaction sheets of company's training programs indicated better rating on training materials from clients. In general project managers are also pleased with the reduced cycle time on revision of training program and creation of new programs.

Discuss and Analysis of Level 4 Results

The bottom-line results are measurable for training "Enhance the Appliance of Training Materials". Although it did not focus on "dollar value" at this stage of the study due to the complexity of data collection, the business impact is obvious and will affect business conducting positively.

The direct business impacts are:

- Increased customer satisfaction
- Reduced cost on design and developing product
- Increased productivity
- Increased quality
- More competitive in the market
- Faster response to the needs of customers
- Increased strategic advantage

These business results are measurable.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The following conclusions have been drawn and recommendations have been made to the training program “Enhance the Appearance of Training Materials”.

- Overall the training is very successful. The objectives have been met, the knowledge and skills of participants have increased, transfer of training has occurred, and direct linkage of impact on the business bottom line has been witnessed.
- The training is necessary for all consultants within the organization
- It is work-related and will increase effectiveness, efficiency, quality, and productivity.
- The training has direct linkage to company’s vision and mission
- The consultants who attended training find themselves equipped with better document design knowledge and skills, more confident and competent in creating and managing larger document files, having greater speed in responding business opportunities
- Company’s standards on training document formatting have been clarified and emphasized.
- The training is a good investment for company
- Establishing a internal training as business routine

The rewarding results from the report suggest that company and each individual will be beneficial from this training program in a long run. There is a direct linkage between training and business bottom line. Many valuable comments, issues and suggestions brought out by the consultants will be used in improving current training design, development, and delivery. In broader scope, this training program promoted an innovative learning environment within the organization.

The positive results will certainly help senior executives in making decisions on establishing internal training as a business routine.